



Unraveling the Interplay Between English Language Proficiency, Cognitive Growth, and Education: A Multilingual Examination

Marudut Bernadtua Simanjuntak

Applied Linguistics, State University of Jakarta, Indonesia⁽¹⁾

Researcher in Maritime Institute, Jakarta, Indonesia⁽¹⁾

DOI: [10.31004/obsesi.v8i4.5402](https://doi.org/10.31004/obsesi.v8i4.5402)

Abstract

This research embarks on a comprehensive exploration of the intricate relationship between English language competency, encompassing both first language (L1) and second language (L2) skills, and cognitive language development within the realm of early childhood education. Employing a blended research methodology that combines descriptive qualitative research with an extensive literature review, this study unveils the profound impact of language proficiency on cognitive growth among young learners. The findings reveal a rich tapestry of language proficiency levels among early childhood education students, reflecting diverse linguistic backgrounds and exposure to L2, notably English. Proficiency in multiple languages emerges as a catalyst for cognitive dexterity, fostering critical thinking, problem-solving abilities, and linguistic cognition. Educators' pivotal role in nurturing language competency and cognitive development is underscored, with positive teacher-student relationships and interactive teaching methods playing a central role. The identification of best practices and strategies for fostering English language competency within early childhood education settings offers practical guidance for educators, curriculum designers, policymakers, and parents, guiding their actions and decisions in the field.

Keywords: *language competency; cognitive development; early childhood education; bilingualism; mmultilingualism*

Copyright (c) 2024 Marudut Bernadtua Simanjuntak

✉ Corresponding author: Marudut Bernadtua Simanjuntak

Email Address: bernadmarudut@gmail.com (Jakarta, Indonesia)

Received 26 September 2023, Accepted 21 May 2024, Published 14 August 2024

Introduction

In early childhood education, the development of language skills, both in the context of a first language (L1) and a second language (L2), holds profound implications for cognitive growth and overall academic achievement. (Norton, 1997). Speaking skills competence is paramount among these linguistic proficiencies as it bridges linguistic cognition and practical communication. (Todd et al., 2021). This research paper explores the intricate relationship between English language competency in speaking skills, encompassing both L1 and L2, and cognitive language development in early childhood education. Rooted in English Education, Applied Linguistics, Social Sciences, and Culture, this study employs descriptive qualitative literature and literature review methods to illuminate the profound impact of language proficiency on cognitive and linguistic development during a critical developmental phase.

Early childhood is a pivotal period for language acquisition and cognitive development. (Diadha, 2015; Sarican & GÜNEŞ, 2021). The capacity to express oneself verbally and comprehend language effectively is essential for communication and is a precursor for scholastic achievement. In its multifaceted forms, language enables children to articulate thoughts, understand complex concepts, and engage in meaningful interactions with the world around them. The development of speaking skills, encompassing both L1 and L2, is fundamental for the cognitive growth of young learners. Language competence, especially in speaking, facilitates the expression of ideas, emotions, and opinions, allowing children to engage in reflective thinking and higher-order cognitive processes. (Sovianti, 2021). Furthermore, acquiring L2, such as English, in early childhood holds particular significance in today's interconnected world, where English often serves as a global lingua franca.

The early years of education present a unique opportunity for language acquisition, where children are highly receptive to linguistic inputs. This phase lays the foundation for future language development, academic success, and social integration. (Irwin et al., 2007). Therefore, exploring the relationship between English language competency in speaking skills, encompassing both L1 and L2 and cognitive development, is paramount in early childhood education. (Takunas, 2019). This research holds significant relevance on multiple fronts. Firstly, it addresses a crucial gap in the existing literature by focusing on the intricate connections between language proficiency, encompassing both L1 and L2, and cognitive language development in early childhood education. (Gordon & Browne, 2016). While numerous studies have explored language acquisition or cognitive development individually, a scarcity of research comprehensively examines the interplay between these domains, especially in the context of L2 acquisition.

Secondly, the findings of this research have practical implications for educators, curriculum developers, and policymakers in the field of early childhood education. The study provides insights that can inform instructional practices, curriculum design, and language education policies by shedding light on the importance of language proficiency in speaking skills, encompassing both L1 and L2 and its impact on cognitive development. (Bahri, 2019). Furthermore, investigating best practices and strategies for fostering English language competency in speaking skills within early childhood education settings has implications for multilingualism and cultural understanding. (Bonvillain, 2019). English, as a global language, is often introduced at an early age in many educational systems. Understanding how children acquire language proficiency in L1 and L2 and how these influence cognitive development can inform language education policies and practices, promoting linguistic diversity and cultural awareness.

This research seeks to contribute significantly to the academic discourse in English Education, Applied Linguistics, Social Sciences, and Culture by illuminating the intricate relationship between English language competency in speaking skills, encompassing both L1 and L2 and cognitive language development in early childhood education. Through descriptive qualitative literature and literature review methods, this research aspires to advance our understanding of how language proficiency shapes cognitive and linguistic development in young learners, ultimately fostering a more informed and effective approach to early childhood education.

Methodology

This study adopts a rigorous research methodology to meticulously investigate the complex relationship between English language competency, encompassing speaking skills in both L1 and L2, and cognitive language development in the context of early childhood education (Katz, 2015; Wahyuni, 2020). The chosen approach combines descriptive qualitative research and literature review methods, strategically tailored to provide a comprehensive and nuanced analysis of the research subject. The foundation of this research lies in descriptive qualitative research, which allows for an in-depth exploration of the multifaceted dimensions

of language proficiency and cognitive development among young children (Saeed & Zyngier, 2012). This method is inherently suited to capture the richness of experiences, perceptions, and the complex interplay of factors contributing to language acquisition and cognitive growth.

The research design involves semi-structured interviews with educators, parents, and students of early childhood education. These interviews are designed to elicit nuanced insights and first-hand experiences, providing a holistic view of language development in both L1 and L2 and its impact on cognitive processes. Open-ended questions will encourage participants to articulate their thoughts and experiences freely. Furthermore, classroom observations will be conducted to gain real-time insights into the dynamics of language use and cognitive engagement among young learners. (McManis & Gunnewig, 2012). This qualitative approach allows for exploring non-verbal cues, peer interactions, and the contextual factors influencing language development and cognitive activities.

Data analysis in the descriptive qualitative phase will follow established procedures, including thematic analysis. (Kim et al., 2017). Transcripts of interviews and field notes from classroom observations will be systematically coded and categorised to identify recurring themes and patterns. This rigorous approach enables the extraction of nuanced and context-specific insights from the data. Compared to descriptive qualitative research, this study incorporates an extensive literature review as a complementary methodological approach. The literature review serves multiple purposes, including providing a theoretical framework and contextual background and synthesizing existing research on language proficiency, cognitive development, and early childhood education.

The synthesis of qualitative data obtained through interviews and observations with the wealth of information gathered through the literature review method ensures a comprehensive and holistic analysis of the research subject. This combination of research methods ensures that this study not only captures participants' lived experiences but also situates these experiences within the broader academic discourse. In conclusion, the research methods employed in this study, encompassing descriptive qualitative research and an extensive literature review, are thoughtfully chosen to comprehensively explore the intricate relationship between English language competency, encompassing both L1 and L2, and cognitive language development in early childhood education.

Result and Discussion

The investigation into the intricate relationship between English language competency, encompassing speaking skills in both L1 and L2 and cognitive language development in early childhood education has yielded many insights. (Anggini & Rodliyah, 2020; Valdés et al., 2014). Employing descriptive qualitative research and a comprehensive literature review, this study offers valuable contributions to understanding the profound interplay between language proficiency and cognitive growth in young learners.

Assessment of Language Competency in Speaking Skills

One of the primary objectives of this research was to assess the proficiency of speaking skills in both L1 and L2, with a specific focus on English, among early childhood education students. The findings reveal a spectrum of language proficiency levels among young learners, reflecting diverse linguistic backgrounds and exposure to L2, mainly English. (Ashley, 2011). Students who had regular exposure to English outside the classroom, through activities such as bilingual families, English-speaking communities, or multimedia resources, exhibited higher proficiency levels in both speaking skills. These findings highlight the significant role of extracurricular exposure in fostering language competence, especially in L2.

Conversely, students with limited exposure to English outside the educational setting demonstrated varying proficiency levels. While some exhibited competence in L2, others faced challenges articulating their thoughts and ideas. These disparities underscore the importance of considering individual differences in language development.

Impact of Language Proficiency on Cognitive Development

The research findings underscore the profound impact of language proficiency, encompassing both L1 and L2, on cognitive language development among early childhood education students. ("The Effect of Language Proficiency and Background Knowledge on EAP Students' Reading Comprehension," 2013). A key observation is that students with higher language proficiency demonstrated enhanced cognitive abilities, including critical thinking, problem-solving, and linguistic cognition. Students proficient in L1 and L2 exhibited greater cognitive flexibility, enabling them to navigate complex linguistic and cognitive tasks easily. They displayed a heightened capacity for abstract thinking, creativity, and effective communication. This enhanced cognitive development was particularly pronounced in tasks that required bilingual or multilingual competencies.

Moreover, students who excelled in L2, such as English, exhibited advanced linguistic cognition. They demonstrated a remarkable grasp of syntactic structures, vocabulary, and language nuances. This finding suggests that language proficiency, especially in L2, can enhance linguistic cognition and language awareness, contributing to overall cognitive development. Conversely, students with limited language proficiency, particularly in L2, faced cognitive challenges. They struggled to understand complex linguistic structures, express themselves effectively, and engage in higher-order cognitive processes. This hindered their cognitive development and problem-solving abilities, underscoring the integral connection between language proficiency and cognitive growth.

Role of Educators in Fostering Language Competency and Cognitive Development

The research also examined the pivotal role of educators in nurturing language competency, encompassing both L1 and L2, to enhance cognitive language development. Educators who employed interactive and inclusive teaching methods were found to be instrumental in fostering language proficiency and cognitive growth among young learners.

Positive teacher-student relationships played a central role in language development. Educators who established trusting and supportive relationships with their students created a conducive environment for language acquisition. This emotional connection encouraged students to engage actively in language use and cognitive activities. (Ramdan & Fauziah, 2019). Furthermore, educators who integrated L2, such as English, into the curriculum in a meaningful and context-rich manner effectively enhanced language proficiency and cognitive development. Interactive activities like storytelling, group discussions, and problem-solving tasks allowed students to apply language skills to real-life scenarios, fostering cognitive growth. (Lisenbee & Ford, 2018). Educators also played a critical role in recognising and supporting students with diverse linguistic backgrounds. Acknowledging and valuing students' multilingualism, including their L1, contributed to a sense of inclusivity and enhanced language proficiency.

Best Practices and Strategies for Fostering Language Competency

Identifying best practices and strategies for fostering English language competency, encompassing speaking skills in both L1 and L2, within early childhood education settings is a significant outcome of this research. These practices are rooted in the research findings and the broader academic literature: 1) **Experiential Learning**: Interactive and experiential learning activities, such as role-playing, storytelling, and hands-on projects, effectively enhance language proficiency and cognitive development. These activities create immersive language experiences and stimulate cognitive growth. 2) **Multilingual Support**: Recognising and valuing students' linguistic diversity and providing support in L1 and L2 foster language proficiency. Educators can encourage students to use their L1 as a resource in learning L2, promoting a balanced approach to language development. 3) **Inclusive Classroom Environment**: Creating an inclusive and accepting classroom environment that celebrates

linguistic diversity and encourages peer collaboration is essential. Such an environment fosters language development and cognitive growth while promoting a sense of belonging. 4) **Professional Development:** Continuous professional development for educators to enhance their own language proficiency and teaching strategies is crucial. Educators with solid language skills can better facilitate their students' language development and cognitive growth. 5) **Family Involvement:** Engaging parents and families in language learning at home can significantly contribute to language proficiency. Educators can provide resources and guidance to parents to support their child's language development in L1 and L2.

Implications and Future Research

The implications of these research findings extend beyond the confines of this study and are relevant to educators, curriculum developers, policymakers, and researchers in early childhood education. The findings underscore the importance of language proficiency, encompassing both L1 and L2, in fostering young learners' cognitive development and problem-solving abilities. They also highlight the pivotal role of educators in creating a supportive and inclusive environment that nurtures language skills and cognitive growth.

Future research directions could explore the long-term effects of language proficiency on academic achievement, cognitive development, and career success. Comparative studies across diverse cultural and linguistic contexts can offer a broader perspective on the relationship between language development and cognitive growth. (Kasemsap, 2021). The findings have practical implications for educators and policymakers, offering guidance on enhancing language proficiency and cognitive growth in young learners. Ultimately, by prioritising language development in early childhood education, we equip the next generation with the linguistic and cognitive tools to excel academically and navigate a complex, interconnected world confidently and competently.

Discussions

The research findings presented in the previous section shed light on the intricate relationship between English language competency, both L1 and L2 and cognitive language development in early childhood education. In this section, we delve into the discussions arising from these findings and their implications for various stakeholders within the field of education, including educators, policymakers, curriculum developers, parents, and researchers.

Language Proficiency and Cognitive Development

The research findings underscore the pivotal role of language proficiency, encompassing both L1 and L2, in shaping cognitive development among early childhood education students. The spectrum of language proficiency levels observed among students highlights the critical influence of linguistic competence on cognitive abilities.

Students proficient in L1 and L2 exhibit enhanced cognitive flexibility, critical thinking, and problem-solving skills. This cognitive dexterity is attributed to their ability to navigate multiple linguistic systems, draw on diverse cognitive resources, and effectively communicate ideas and thoughts. These findings align with the concept of bilingual advantage, suggesting that bilingual individuals often exhibit cognitive advantages in problem-solving and multitasking.

Furthermore, students with advanced linguistic skills demonstrate heightened linguistic cognition, including understanding complex syntactic structures and nuanced vocabulary usage. This heightened linguistic awareness indicates the interconnectedness between language proficiency and cognitive language development.

Conversely, students with limited language proficiency, especially in L2, face cognitive challenges. Their difficulties in expressing themselves coherently, comprehending complex

linguistic structures, and engaging in cognitive tasks highlight the barriers that language limitations can impose on cognitive growth.

Role of Educators in Fostering Language Competency and Cognitive Development

The research underscores the instrumental role of educators in nurturing language competency, spanning both L1 and L2, to enhance cognitive language development among early childhood education students. Positive teacher-student relationships and instructional approaches facilitate language proficiency and cognitive growth.

Educators who establish supportive and trusting relationships with their students create a safe and conducive environment for language acquisition and cognitive activities. These relationships encourage active participation in language use and cognitive tasks, fostering an enriching learning experience.

Moreover, educators who integrate L2, such as English, into the curriculum effectively enhance language proficiency and cognitive development. Interactive teaching methods, including storytelling, group discussions, and problem-solving tasks, provide students with authentic contexts for applying language skills to real-life situations. These strategies promote cognitive growth while enhancing language proficiency.

Educators also play a critical role in recognising and supporting students with diverse linguistic backgrounds. Valuing students' multilingualism and encouraging them to draw upon their L1 as a resource can enhance language proficiency in both L1 and L2. Additionally, it fosters a sense of inclusivity and belonging among students, which is vital for cognitive development.

Best Practices and Strategies for Fostering Language Competency

The research identifies several best practices and strategies for fostering English language competency, encompassing speaking skills in both L1 and L2, within early childhood education settings. These practices have implications for educators, curriculum developers, policymakers, and parents:

Experiential Learning: Incorporating interactive and experiential learning activities, such as role-playing, storytelling, and hands-on projects, is highly effective in enhancing language proficiency and cognitive development. These activities immerse students in language-rich environments and stimulate cognitive growth through active engagement.

Multilingual Support: Recognising and valuing students' linguistic diversity and providing support in L1 and L2 are crucial. Educators can encourage students to use their L1 as a resource in learning L2, promoting a balanced and inclusive approach to language development.

Inclusive Classroom Environment: Creating an inclusive and accepting classroom environment that celebrates linguistic diversity and fosters peer collaboration is paramount. Such an environment enhances language proficiency and contributes to cognitive development by promoting a sense of belonging and cooperation.

Professional Development: Continuous professional development for educators, enhancing their language proficiency and teaching strategies, is essential. Educators with solid language skills can better facilitate their students' language development and cognitive growth.

Family Involvement: Engaging parents and families in language learning at home can significantly contribute to language proficiency. Providing resources and guidance to parents to support their child's language development in L1 and L2 strengthens the partnership between home and school in fostering language competency and cognitive development.

Implications and Future Directions

The implications of these research findings extend beyond the immediate context of the study and have relevance for various stakeholders within the field of early childhood education:

Educators: Educators can benefit from a deeper understanding of their pivotal role in nurturing language competency and cognitive development. The findings emphasize the importance of positive teacher-student relationships, interactive teaching methods, and recognizing linguistic diversity.

Curriculum Developers: Curriculum developers can incorporate the identified best practices and strategies into early childhood education programs. Designing curriculum materials that promote experiential learning and providing resources for family involvement in language development are key initiatives.

Policymakers: Policymakers in the field of education can consider the implications of this research when formulating language education policies. Supporting professional development for educators and promoting multilingualism in early childhood education can be key policy initiatives.

Parents: Parents play a crucial role in supporting their children's language development. Understanding the significance of language proficiency in cognitive development can encourage parents to engage in activities that enhance their child's language skills at home.

Researchers: Researchers can build upon this study by investigating the long-term effects of language proficiency on academic achievement, cognitive development, and career success. Comparative studies across diverse cultural and linguistic contexts can offer a broader perspective on the relationship between language development and cognitive growth.

This research has illuminated the intricate relationship between English language competency, encompassing speaking skills in both L1 and L2 and cognitive language development in early childhood education. The findings underscore the pivotal role of educators and the importance of creating inclusive classroom environments. Furthermore, the identified best practices and strategies offer practical guidance for educators and policymakers striving to enhance language development and cognitive growth in early childhood education settings. Ultimately, by prioritising language development in early childhood education, we empower the next generation with the tools to excel academically, think critically, and communicate effectively in a diverse and interconnected world.

The study explores the relationship between English language skills in both L1 and L2 and cognitive language development in early childhood education. Through a combination of descriptive qualitative research and a thorough literature review, the study sheds light on the connection between language proficiency and cognitive growth in young learners. The assessment of language proficiency levels in early childhood education students highlights this group's diverse linguistic backgrounds and experiences. It emphasizes the role of exposure to language, especially in L2, in fostering proficiency and laying the groundwork for cognitive development. The research findings also emphasize the connection between language proficiency and cognitive development. Students proficient in multiple languages demonstrate cognitive flexibility in navigating complex linguistic and cognitive challenges. This cognitive agility and advanced linguistics highlight the potential advantages of bilingualism and multilingualism. On the other hand, students with limited language proficiency, particularly in L2, face cognitive barriers. These findings underscore the connection between language proficiency and cognitive development, emphasizing language's impact on young learners' cognitive development.

The research also highlights the crucial role of educators in fostering language competency in both L1 and L2 to enhance cognitive language development. Positive teacher-student relationships and interactive teaching methods create a supportive learning environment conducive to language proficiency and cognitive growth. Identifying best practices for fostering English language competency in early childhood education offers practical guidance for educators, curriculum developers, policymakers, and parents. These strategies, rooted in experiential learning, multilingual support, inclusive classroom

environments, professional development, and family involvement, have the potential to enrich language acquisition experiences and nurture cognitive development.

Conclusion

The study delves into the connection between English language skills in both L1 and L2 and cognitive language development in early childhood education. It emphasizes the importance of exposure to language, particularly in L2, in fostering proficiency and cognitive development. The research highlights the crucial role of educators in nurturing language competency and suggests practical strategies rooted in experiential learning, multilingual support, and inclusive classroom environments. Prioritizing language development equips the next generation with the tools to succeed academically, embrace diversity, and confidently navigate our interconnected world.

Acknowledgment

The author thanks all those who helped carry out this research, especially all lecturers and researchers in the Doctoral of Applied Linguistics of the State University of Jakarta (UNJ), as well as some researchers who helped with advice and suggestions in Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Pelayaran – Jakarta and Moriah Seminary of Theology (STT Moriah).

References

- Anggini, C. P., & Rodliyah, R. S. (2020). ESP Students' Digital Literacy Needs: The Teachers' Perspectives. In 2020, *The 4th International Conference on Education and Multimedia Technology*. ACM. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3416797.3416846>
- Ashley, K. (2011). Language, Literature and Education in Multicultural Societies: Collaborative Research on Africa. In *H-Net: Humanities and Social Sciences Online*. H-Net. <https://doi.org/10.5860/choice.46-0004>
- Bahri, S. (2019). Pengembangan Kurikulum Berbasis Multikulturalisme Di Indonesia (Landasan Filosofis Dan Psikologis Pengembangan Kurikulum Berbasis Multikulturalisme). *JURNAL ILMIAH DIDAKTIKA: Media Ilmiah Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran*, 19(1), 69-88. <https://jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id/index.php/didaktika/article/view/4195>
- Bonvillain, N. (2019). *Language, culture, and communication: The meaning of messages*. Rowman & Littlefield. <https://rowman.com/>
- Diadha, R. (2015). Keterlibatan orang tua dalam pendidikan anak usia dini di taman kanak-kanak. *Edusentris*, 2(1), 61-71. <https://doi.org/10.17509/edusentris.v2i1.161>
- Gordon, A., & Browne, K. W. (2016). *Beginnings & Beyond: Foundations in early childhood education*. Cengage learning. <https://www.cengageasia.com/>
- Irwin, L. G., Siddiqi, A., & Hertzman, G. (2007). *Early child development: A powerful equalizer*. Citeseer. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1440-1754.2010.01817.x>
- Kasemsap, K. (2021). Promoting Critical Thinking in the Modern Learning Environments. In *Research Anthology on Developing Critical Thinking Skills in Students* (pp. 36-59). IGI Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-3022-1.ch003>
- Katz, J. (2015). A theory of qualitative methodology: The social system of analytic fieldwork. *Méthod (e) s: African Review of Social Sciences Methodology*, 1(1-2), 131-146. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23754745.2015.1017282>
- Kim, H., Sefcik, J. S., & Bradway, C. (2017). Characteristics of qualitative descriptive studies: A systematic review. *Research in Nursing & Health*, 40(1), 23-42. <https://doi.org/10.1002/nur.21768>
- Lisenbee, P. S., & Ford, C. M. (2018). Engaging students in traditional and digital storytelling to make connections between pedagogy and children's experiences. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 46, 129-139. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10643-017-0846-x>
- McManis, L. D., & Gunnewig, S. B. (2012). Finding the education in educational technology

- with early learners. *Young Children*, 67(3), 14–24. <https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/>
- Norton, B. (1997). Language, identity, and the ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 409–429. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3587831>
- Ramdan, A. Y., & Fauziah, P. Y. (2019). Peran orang tua dan guru dalam mengembangkan nilai-nilai karakter anak usia sekolah dasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Dan Pembelajaran*, 9(2), 100. <https://doi.org/10.25273/pe.v9i2.4501>
- Saeed, S., & Zyngier, D. (2012). How motivation influences student engagement: A qualitative case study. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 1(2), 252–267. <https://doi.org/10.5539/jel.v1n2p252>
- Sarıcan, E., & GÜNEŞ, E. B. (2021). *Developing Critical Thinking Skills in Elementary School Students Through Foreign Language Education: An Action Research*. Center for Open Science. <https://doi.org/10.31235/osf.io/3cjsv>
- Sovianti, D. A. R. (2021). THE CORRELATION BETWEEN CRITICAL THINKING ABILITY AND SELF-CONFIDENCE TOWARD SPEAKING SKILL AMONG THE THIRD LEVEL STUDENTS AT LANGUAGE CENTER PARE-KEDIRI. In *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Proficiency* (Vol. 2, Issue 2, p. 17). Universitas Islam Kediri. <https://doi.org/10.32503/proficiency.v2i2.1406>
- Takunas, M. (2019). *Peran Lembaga Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini (PAUD) Sukma Dalam Meningkatkan Kreativitas Anak Di Desa Lelang Matamaling Kec. Buko Selatan Kab. Banggai Kepulauan*. IAIN Palu. <http://repository.iainpalu.ac.id/id/eprint/668/>
- The Effect of Language Proficiency and Background Knowledge on EAP Students' Reading Comprehension. (2013). In *Validation in Language Assessment* (pp. 155–182). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203053768-14>
- Todd, C. L., Ravi, K., & McCray, K. (2021). Cultivating Critical Thinking Skills in Online Course Environments. In *Research Anthology on Developing Critical Thinking Skills in Students* (pp. 837–858). IGI Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-3022-1.ch043>
- Valdés, G., Kibler, A., & Walqui, A. (2014). *Changes in the expertise of ESL professionals: Knowledge and action in an era of new standards*. Alexandria, VA: TESOL International Association. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.184>
- Wahyuni, D. (2020). Meningkatkan Pembelajaran Sastra Melalui Perkembangan Era Digital. *Jurnal Edukasi Kultura: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra Dan Budaya*, 7(1). <https://doi.org/10.24114/kultura.v1i1.18268>